

# Environmental Science & Technology

## Manuscript Details

Manuscript ID: es-2015-049706


Manuscript Article  
Type:

Date Submitted: 09-Oct-2015

Manuscript Title: Impact to Underground Sources of Drinking Water and Domestic Wells from Production Well Stimulation and Completion Practices in the Pavillion, WY Field

Authors: DiGiulio, Dominic  
Jackson, Robert B.


## Summary Ratings

 Rate the overall importance of this paper to the field of environmental science and technology (10 - High Importance / 1 - Low Importance):


9

 Rate the originality/novelty of the submission (10 - High Originality / 1 - Low Originality):

7

 Rate the technical quality of the submission (10 - Excellent Technical Quality / 1 - Poor Technical Quality):

7

 Rate the clarity of the submission's presentation (10 - Excellent Presentation / 1 - Poor Presentation):

5

## Recommendation

Accept as is; no revisions needed.

Accept, with minor revisions noted.

☒ Accept, with major revisions noted.

Reconsider after major revisions; outcome in doubt.

Reject.

## Comments

Comments to the Editorial Office (optional)

I have not previously reviewed papers for ES&T, so I dont have a firm benchmark for the numerical

ratings above. I rated the overall importance as a 9 because this is a very important paper regarding the impacts of oil and gas extraction in general, and hydraulic fracturing in particular on drinking water resources. It should be published as expeditiously as possible after revision to address comments edits for clarity.

In addition to the comments in the document attached, the paper would benefit from a good editing (typos, grammar, complete sentences, location of tables and figures at better places corresponding to relevant text, improved clarity)

#### Comments to the Author

Type your review directly into the text box or type "Review attached" (and attach file below), as appropriate.

Review attached.

This is an important paper and should be published. In addition to responding to the attached review, recommend careful editing (typos, grammar, complete sentences, location of tables and figures at better places corresponding to relevant text, improved clarity)

#### Files attached

- [Comments on draft DiGgiulio and Jackson paper 012916.xlsx](#) [PDF](#) [HTML](#)  
✓ This file is for the Author and Editor

 Print  Close Window

---

ACS Paragon Plus Environment. Copyright © 2016 American Chemical Society. All rights reserved.

© Thomson Reuters | © ScholarOne, Inc., 2015. All Rights Reserved.

Knowledgebase & My Requests | [Get Help Now](#)